

The Effectiveness Of Civil Servant Training In Improving The Performance Of Local Government Apparatus

Anace Kambu¹, Dian Ferriswara^{2*}, Sarwani³, Sri Kamariyah⁴

¹⁻⁴Fakultas Ilmu Administrasi, Universitas Dr. Soetomo, Surabaya, Indonesia

*Email Korespondensi: dianferriswara@unitomo.ac.id

Abstract. *This study examines the effectiveness of education and training programs in improving employee performance and identifies the factors influencing training outcomes at the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Southwest Papua Province. A qualitative descriptive approach was employed, utilizing interviews, observations, and documentation, with key informants including the Head of BKPSDM. Data were analyzed using the interactive model of Miles et al. (2014), encompassing data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing. Findings reveal that education and training programs at BKPSDM significantly enhanced employee performance, as evidenced by improved timeliness in task completion, increased knowledge, skills, and expertise, and notable positive changes in employee behavior and attitudes. Training outcomes were also reflected in improved workplace discipline and greater responsibility among civil servants. Evaluation of program effectiveness employed five levels: participant reaction, learning achievement, behavioral change, organizational impact, and cost-effectiveness, all of which indicated favorable results. Factors influencing training effectiveness included the relevance of training materials to employee roles, appropriate scheduling that minimized work disruption, the use of clear and supportive training methods, and the competence of instructors in delivering material effectively. These findings demonstrate that well-planned and well-delivered training programs can strengthen the capacity and professionalism of civil servants, enabling them to better fulfill governmental and developmental responsibilities while supporting overall organizational performance improvement. In addition, the study highlights the importance of continuous monitoring and feedback throughout the training process to ensure sustained improvements in employee performance. It suggests that the involvement of employees in the design and planning stages of training programs can enhance the relevance and applicability of the content, fostering greater engagement and retention of knowledge.*

Keywords: BKPSDM, civil servants, education, Effectiveness, performance

1. INTRODUCTION

A modern organization is expected to be an office management application today, where the continuity of work in the organization requires a good system supported by human resources who are capable in carrying out the activities contained in the organization. Enhancing employee performance is pursued through targeted development initiatives, particularly education and training programs. Achieving optimal organizational performance requires employees to participate in adequate education and training that align with their roles, enabling them to acquire the necessary skills and competencies to perform their tasks effectively.

Education, training, and professional courses constitute key instruments for developing and enhancing the quality of human resources. However, these initiatives often face persistent challenges and barriers that hinder their effectiveness in improving employee performance. Employee development through training can strengthen employee performance, improve knowledge, expertise and skills to form as early as possible the personality of professional employees.

Simamora (2002) describes education and training as a series of structured activities intended to enhance an individual's skills, knowledge, experience, or attitudes. The implementation of training (DIKLAT) is expected to equip employees with adequate competencies, thereby increasing their work productivity and enabling the organization to deliver quality services. Such training initiatives are relevant for both new and existing employees. Similarly, Dessler (2004) emphasizes that education and training consist of activities designed to equip employees—whether newly recruited or long-serving—with the essential skills required to perform their duties effectively. For experienced employees, training serves not only to address performance deficiencies but also to facilitate the acquisition of new knowledge, technologies, and competencies, ensuring their adaptability to evolving organizational policies and developments.

Employee education and training represent key human resource development initiatives aimed at enhancing knowledge, competencies, and skills while simultaneously improving employee performance. These programs not only develop intellectual capacity but also contribute to shaping employee character and work attitudes. Consequently, organizations seeking growth and competitiveness must prioritize education and training as strategic efforts to enhance performance. Such initiatives play a crucial role in increasing organizational productivity, effectiveness, and efficiency. To sustain employee competencies and support organizational advancement, training programs should be implemented on a regular basis and carefully planned according to the specific developmental needs of each employee.

Employees serving as State Civil Apparatus (ASN) occupy a critical position in the execution of governmental functions. Their importance is evident in the role they play in staffing governmental positions, which are predominantly filled by ASN personnel. As an essential component of the state apparatus, ASN employees contribute significantly to achieving national objectives. They are expected to embody loyalty and adherence to Pancasila, the 1945 Constitution, the state, and the government, while demonstrating unity and a strong sense of responsibility in performing governmental and developmental duties (Tjandra, 2013).

According to Law Number 5 of 2014 on the State Civil Apparatus, Article 1, Paragraph 1, the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) is defined as a profession encompassing civil servants and government employees working under employment agreements within government institutions. Furthermore, Paragraph 2 specifies that ASN employees consist of civil servants and contractual government employees who are appointed by personnel supervisory authorities, assigned to governmental positions or other state functions, and compensated in accordance with statutory provisions.

Based on the explanation of Law Number 5 of 2014 above, it is clear that civil As State Civil Apparatus (ASN) employees, civil servants are required to meet specific qualifications to hold public office. Consequently, it is essential to enhance their capabilities to ensure they perform their duties professionally and responsibly in implementing governmental and developmental tasks while maintaining integrity and remaining free from corruption, collusion, and nepotism. One approach to strengthening civil servant competencies is through systematic development and guidance initiatives aimed at improving employee professionalism, thereby enabling the provision of high-quality public services.

Law Number 5 of 2014 on the State Civil Apparatus emphasizes the importance of competency development for employees through education and training programs. Article 70 affirms that every ASN employee has the right and opportunity to enhance their competencies, primarily through structured education and training initiatives. During the orientation or probationary period, these programs are designed to cultivate moral integrity and honesty, foster a spirit of nationalism, develop strong and responsible character traits, and strengthen professional expertise and field-specific competencies (Fathurrochman, 2017).

Government Regulation Number 101 of 2000 on education and training emphasizes that shaping the ideal civil servant requires structured guidance through education and training (diklat). These initiatives are intended to foster personal character and a spirit of public service while simultaneously enhancing the quality, substantive expertise, and leadership capabilities of civil servants (Fransiska et al., 2016).

Government Regulation Number 101 of 2000, Article 4, on Education and Training for Civil Servant Positions, stipulates that civil servant training comprises in-service training, leadership training, and functional training. In-service training aims to develop civil servants' knowledge, skills, and attitudes to enable them to perform governmental and developmental duties effectively. This category includes leadership training, functional training, and technical training. Leadership training (Diklatpim) is designed to enhance insight, knowledge, expertise, skills, attitudes, and behaviors related to public sector leadership, ensuring civil servants meet leadership competency standards for specific structural levels. Meanwhile, functional training focuses on providing the specialized knowledge and skills required for functional positions, ensuring that competency requirements are met in accordance with the type and level of each functional role.

The Southwest Papua Provincial Human Resources Development Personnel Agency, as one of the Regional Apparatus Organizations (OPD) in Southwest Papua Province, plays an important role in supporting government affairs related to human resource development which

is the domain of regional autonomy. According to Southwest Papua Governor Regulation No. 23 of 2022 on the Organizational Structure and Work Procedures of the Provincial Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency, the agency is mandated to support the Governor in implementing local government functions, particularly in the field of education and training for the State Civil Apparatus (ASN).

Education and training (DIKLAT) are crucial for employees of the Southwest Papua Provincial Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM), as they enhance competencies, knowledge, and skills, thereby enabling employees to perform their duties more effectively and efficiently. DIKLAT can also increase employees' awareness of applicable work procedures and standards, as well as help them develop relevant technical skills.

The effective implementation of the core duties and functions of the Southwest Papua Provincial Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) requires highly qualified and professional human resources. Such personnel are essential for managing internal personnel services within the agency, which ultimately aims to deliver excellent public service to the community. Therefore, the human resource capabilities of the Regional Civil Service Agency must be improved through Education and Training of Structural Positions, Technical Education and Training, comparative studies, seminars, discussions or other activities relevant to their field of duty. This can be done if it is supported by a sufficient budget and adequate supporting facilities and infrastructure

Accordingly, this study seeks to describe and analyze the effectiveness of education and training in enhancing employee performance, as well as to identify the factors influencing the effectiveness of such programs for State Civil Apparatus (ASN) within the Southwest Papua Provincial Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM).

2. THEORETICAL STUDIES

Education and training constitute key elements in human resource (HR) development, as they not only expand knowledge but also enhance work-related skills, thereby improving overall productivity (Sumarsono, 2009). Employee education and training are integral components of comprehensive HR development. Education involves the provision of additional knowledge by an organization to its employees, whereas training refers to a more targeted educational process focused on developing specific skills and competencies required for an employee's designated role (Martoyo, 2002).

Education and training are regarded as long-term investments for organizations, as growing institutions consistently implement and support such initiatives with careful attention to their processes. By enhancing employee capabilities and skills through these programs, overall employee performance is expected to improve accordingly.

Hasibuan (2002) explains that education and training represent a short-term learning process implemented through systematic and organized methods, enabling operational employees to acquire job-specific knowledge and skills. Education and training are closely linked to employee development, which focuses on enhancing both technical and managerial competencies. While education is generally theory-oriented, conducted in a classroom setting, and requires a longer duration, training is practice-oriented, delivered in the workplace, and typically shorter in length.

Notoatmodjo (2003) defines education and training as efforts to develop human resources, particularly in enhancing intellectual capacity and personal character. In line with this perspective, Government Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia No. 101 of 2000 concerning Education and Training for Civil Servant Positions describes civil servant training as a structured learning process aimed at improving the competencies and capabilities of civil servants.

Rivai and Sagala (2011) describe education and training as a systematic process aimed at transforming employee behavior to support the achievement of organizational objectives. Training specifically focuses on developing the skills and competencies required for employees to effectively perform their current roles. Similarly, Moekijat (2003) emphasizes that education and training constitute a component of learning designed to acquire and enhance skills outside the formal education system, typically within a relatively short timeframe and using practice-oriented rather than theory-driven methods.

Handoko (2006) notes that education and training programs are designed with two primary objectives, namely:

- a. Training and development initiatives are implemented to bridge the gap between employees' existing skills and abilities and the competency requirements of their positions.
- b. Education and training programs are intended to enhance employees' efficiency and effectiveness in accomplishing established work objectives.

Sofyandi (2008) outlines the objectives of education and training as follows:

- a. Education and training help shorten the learning period required for employees to achieve acceptable performance levels, enabling them to acquire job-related skills more quickly.
- b. Education and training are intended to enhance employee performance in carrying out their current job responsibilities.
- c. Education and training are expected to foster positive attitudes and work behaviors among employees in the performance of their duties.
- d. Aid in solving operation problems, Education and training help solve the day-to-day operational problems of the institution.
- e. Education and training aim not only to address immediate performance needs but also to meet long-term workforce requirements.
- f. Education and training also provide direct benefits to employees by enhancing their knowledge and competencies, enabling them to perform at a higher professional level.

Moekijat (2003) stated that factors that can affect education and training program programs include:

- a. People who are trained.

The selection of good education and training participants is very important if you want to get profitable results. Trainees should receive training that aligns with their interests and aptitudes, ensuring they are prepared for roles they both enjoy and are well-suited to perform.

- b. Instructor

A capable teacher makes a huge contribution to the success of the education and training program.

- c. Period of education and training

The length of the education and training period depends on the skills to be acquired, the learning ability of the participants, and the educational and training media used.

- d. Education and training materials

Education and training materials in the form of materials tailored to the tasks and jobs of education and training participants.

- e. Training methods

The way it is carried out in the implementation of education and training that is tailored to the tasks or work

According to Faustini Cardoso Gomes (2000), the effectiveness of education and training programs can be assessed using information obtained across five distinct levels:

- a. **Reactions** – This level measures participants’ perceptions of the training program, typically through post-training questionnaires. Participants are asked to evaluate their overall satisfaction with the training, including the performance of instructors, the relevance and clarity of the materials delivered, the quality of supporting resources, and the training environment (e.g., venue, schedule, refreshments, and physical comfort).
- b. **Learning** – This level evaluates the extent to which participants have acquired the intended concepts, knowledge, and skills delivered during the training program. Assessment methods typically include written examinations (essay or multiple-choice formats), performance tests, and simulation exercises.
- c. **Behavior** – This level measures changes in participants’ work behavior by comparing their performance before and after training to determine the extent to which the program influences their on-the-job practices.
- d. **Organizational Results** – This level evaluates the broader impact of education and training on the work unit or organization. Data are collected before and after training using indicators such as productivity, employee turnover, absenteeism, workplace accidents, complaints, quality improvements, and client satisfaction.
- e. **Cost-Effectiveness** – This level examines the financial efficiency of education and training programs by comparing the costs of program implementation with the expenses that would otherwise result from organizational problems, thereby determining whether the training investment is justified.

Performance refers to the measurable outcomes produced by an employee in accordance with their assigned duties and responsibilities, reflecting the extent to which expected results are achieved. In today’s era of globalization, business organizations face intense competition, and modern organizational theorists increasingly emphasize that human resources are critical assets. These human resources are fundamentally expected to contribute effectively to organizational performance and support the attainment of organizational goals.

Actually, performance is also the behavior of employees in doing business, and behavior is a function of the relationship between organisms and stimuli in the form of the environment,

both physical and socio-cultural, so performance is formed from such a relationship function. So, there are individual characteristics and environmental characteristics that shape performance. Bernardin and Russel (2003) define performance as a documented record of accomplishments resulting from the execution of specific tasks or activities within a given period. The definition of performance from Bernardin is synonymous with the definition of work achievement according to As'ad (2005) who explains that work achievement is the result achieved by a person according to the measure applicable to the job in question.

Mangkunegara (2005) defines human resource performance as the quality and quantity of outputs produced by employees within a given period, reflecting the extent to which they fulfill their assigned responsibilities. Similarly, Kusnadi (2002) describes performance as any deliberate action, activity, or implementation directed toward achieving specific goals or targets.

Simamora (2002) notes that performance reflects the fulfillment of specific job requirements, which are often manifested in non-physical outcomes. Nawawi (2007) similarly emphasizes that performance—often referred to as work—encompasses both tangible (physical/material) and intangible (non-physical/non-material) results derived from the execution of tasks.

Good performance should have the following characteristics (Kusnadi, 2002):

a. Rational

Good performance should be accepted by common sense. No good performance is irrational.

b. Consistent

Good performance should be in line with the values that exist within the organization and the departments and the goals of the organization.

c. Clearly

Good performance must be able to be stated precisely and clearly and not give rise to different interpretations.

d. Efficient

Good performance as much as possible through minimal sacrifice of funds with satisfactory results.

e. Challenged

Good performance should provide a high challenge for the perpetrator and be sought to be an effective motivator.

f. Directional

Good performance should be directed to a specific goal, either through the line of command or detachment.

g. Discipline

Good performance should be done through high discipline.

1. Systematic

Performance should be done systematically and not randomly.

a. Achievable

Good performance should be directed to achieve the targets or objectives that have been set.

b. Agreed

Good performance should be agreed upon by all parties involved, both from the top leadership to the lowest implementer.

c. Related to time

Good performance should be associated with the time set.

d. Oriented to group cooperation

Good performance should be directed to group cooperation. Group performance is generally more effective and efficient than individual performance

3. RESEARCH METHODS

This study on the effectiveness of civil servant training in improving the performance of government apparatus in the Regional Government of Southwest Papua Province employed a qualitative research approach. A descriptive method was applied to examine the current status of a group of individuals, specific phenomena, systems of thought, or events (Nazir, 2011). Data collection techniques included interviews, observations, and documentation, with informants comprising key officials, notably the Head of the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of the Southwest Papua Provincial Government. Data were analyzed using the interactive model developed by Miles et al. (2014), which consists of three stages: data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing.

4. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

a. Effectiveness of Education and Training in Enhancing the Performance of Employees at the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM), Southwest Papua Province

The effectiveness of education and training is best understood as a continuous process rather than a one-time effort. In today's era of rapid technological and knowledge development, education and training play a pivotal role in equipping employees with the creativity and competence needed to achieve organizational goals effectively and efficiently. These programs are designed to enhance employees' mastery of skills and knowledge, thereby improving their overall performance. Furthermore, education and training place particular emphasis on strengthening human relations skills, which are essential for effective workplace collaboration and service delivery.

The effectiveness of education and training serves as a strategic effort to develop human resources, particularly in enhancing intellectual capacity and shaping individual character. Within organizations, education and training are often integrated under the single term "training," representing a comprehensive process of developing the skills and competencies required by the organization. Formal education in this context focuses on long-term skill development aligned with organizational objectives, whereas training—often associated with practical exercises—is a component of the educational process aimed at improving specific abilities of individuals or groups. Practical exercises, such as learning to operate a computer or navigate the internet, serve as means to acquire specialized technical skills. Training thus functions as an essential mechanism for building human resource capacity to meet the challenges of the globalization era, which is characterized by intense competition and rapid change. Consequently, training activities are indispensable for preparing employees to adapt, remain competitive, and contribute effectively in this highly demanding environment.

1) Determination of Needs

It is undeniable that financing education and training activities places a financial burden on organizations. Therefore, it is crucial to conduct a thorough needs assessment to ensure that training programs are implemented based on actual employee requirements. Such an assessment helps identify competency gaps in performing general governmental and developmental tasks. Consequently, education and training can be designed to address these deficiencies, making them more effective in supporting employees' work performance and contributing to organizational goals.

By determining the needs of employees and organizations, this will support the success of the organization in improving the quality of training implementation. So that training needs must always be programmed, carefully planned by considering the needs of the organization, the needs of the position and ability of each employee as well as the needs of the type of training, costs, and employees who follow it. In addition, by conducting an analysis of training needs, the training field knows the needs of employees and organizations in order to improve competencies to support their work and to improve employee performance

2) Training Objectives

Referring to the objectives outlined by Nitisemito (2000), it is evident that the aims of education and training align closely with the broader goal of civil servant development, namely enhancing knowledge, skills, and attitudes to ensure the effective and successful implementation of governmental and developmental tasks. Training is specifically targeted toward producing civil servants who possess competencies relevant to their positions and responsibilities. Clearly defining these objectives is essential to achieving optimal training outcomes. The findings of this study further indicate that training serves a dual purpose: improving the competencies of individual employees as participants and enhancing the overall performance of the organization.

3) Evaluation of Training Programs

Evaluating the implementation of education and training programs is essential, as such programs function as a process of transformation for employees. Siswanto (2003) emphasizes that evaluation activities are integral to education and training, particularly within teaching and learning processes, noting that the success of such programs largely depends on the quality of the evaluation conducted. In this context, evaluations are carried out by interviewing education and training alumni, specifically civil servants who have participated in these programs, to gather feedback on their experiences. The results of these evaluations are utilized by the Regional Civil Service Agency, particularly the Education and Training Agency, as valuable input for improving the design and delivery of future training programs.

a) Reactions

Evaluating participants' reactions involves assessing their level of satisfaction with the training experience. A training program is considered effective when participants perceive it as engaging and satisfactory, as this fosters motivation to learn. Positive reactions typically emerge when training is implemented smoothly and effectively, whereas dissatisfaction tends to generate negative responses. Feedback from alumni of the Human Resources Development Personnel Agency of the Southwest Papua Provincial Government indicates that the majority have successfully internalized and mastered the concepts delivered during the training programs.

b) Learnings

Training participants are considered to have learned effectively when they demonstrate changes in attitude, increased knowledge, and enhanced skills. Consequently, measuring these three dimensions is essential for evaluating the success of a training program. In the absence of attitudinal change, knowledge acquisition, and skill improvement, the program may be deemed ineffective. This assessment emphasizes internal changes, particularly shifts in attitude that occur during the training process. Feedback from alumni of the Human Resources Development Personnel Agency of the Southwest Papua Provincial Government indicates notable positive transformations, including improved attitudes, behaviors, knowledge, and skills. These outcomes suggest that the learning processes within the training programs have been well implemented and effective, leading to significant improvements among participants compared to their pre-training conditions.

c) Behaviors

This behavior evaluation is more focused on behavior changes after the training participants return to the workplace. Will the changes in attitudes that have occurred after participating in the training will also be implemented after the participants return to work, so that the assessment of this behavior is more external. In other words, this behavior evaluation looks at changes in the behavior of training participants after returning to work. With the implementation of education and training, many employees have undergone changes, be it changes in behavior or changes in attitudes in their workplace. This happens because after participating in the education and training, there has been an increase in

competence both in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes and behaviors of training participants in general have become better, besides that the awareness in civil servants to complete their work is much better and their performance has increased than before participating in the training.

d) Organizational Result

Training outcomes may produce various alternative explanations or new results, making it challenging to precisely identify all impacts. Consequently, many organizations justify training initiatives on the assumption that training and development contribute to overall organizational effectiveness. Evaluations at this level focus on the ultimate results observed after participants complete their training. Alumni of the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency of the Southwest Papua Provincial Government reported notable positive changes following participation in training programs. Their work performance improved significantly, including more efficient task completion, heightened discipline, and an increased sense of responsibility in carrying out their duties.

e) Cost Effectivity

This evaluation criterion focuses on assessing the financial implications of training programs by comparing the costs incurred for their implementation with the potential costs of organizational problems they aim to address, as well as the outcomes achieved. The aim is to determine whether the training investment is proportional to the results obtained. Feedback from alumni of the Human Resources Development Personnel Agency of the Southwest Papua Provincial Government indicates no objection to the costs of training implementation, as improvements in their performance following the training were evident. Overall, the expenses incurred for the training were considered commensurate with the positive outcomes produced.

b. Factors Influencing the Effectiveness of Education and Training for State Civil Apparatus (ASN) at the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Southwest Papua Province:

1) Education and training materials

Education and Training Materials consisting of materials according to the needs of employees and materials are able to increase knowledge. The material provided during education and training is very useful and supports the field of work of each

employee, the educational materials and training provided must be in accordance with the specific job

2) Education and training time

The education and training time consisting of Education and training time does not interfere with the work. The implementation of training is very appropriate and is given at a time when employees really need to improve their skills and expertise in their respective fields of work and the timing of the implementation of education and training is very much in accordance with the provisions of the institution and various existing work activities so that it does not clash with work responsibilities.

3) Education and training methods

Education and training methods consisting of methods that support the material and education and training methods are easy to understand in, the education and training methods used are in accordance with the ability of employees to understand the content of the training and the methods applied in education and training are in accordance with the needs and duties of each employee which can ultimately improve the ability of employees to carry out their duties and responsibilities

4) Quality of instructors

The quality of the instructor consisting of the Instructor masters the material and the Instructor provides the material clearly, the ability of the instructor to deliver educational and training materials, can motivate the participants such as the ability to involve all participants in the education and training process and the instructor is able to give confidence to the participants that the education and training are held for the benefit of the participants in carrying out their work, as well as the ability of the trainer in the Providing assistance with employee difficulties is excellent

5. CONCLUSION

The education and training programs at the Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) of Southwest Papua Province have proven effective in enhancing employee performance. This effectiveness is reflected in improved task completion timeliness and the increased knowledge, skills, and expertise demonstrated by employees following their participation in these programs.

The evaluation of education and training implementation indicates that these programs have significantly contributed to changes in employees' workplace behavior and attitudes. Following participation in training, employees demonstrated improved competencies,

including enhanced knowledge, skills, and attitudes. Furthermore, civil servants exhibited greater awareness and responsibility in completing their tasks, resulting in improved performance compared to their pre-training levels.

Factors that affect the effectiveness of Training at the Southwest Papua Province Personnel and Human Resources Development Agency (BKPSDM) include Education and Training Materials consisting of materials according to employee needs and materials that are able to increase knowledge. Time for education and training that does not interfere with work. The methods of education and training consist of Methods that support the material and Methods of education and training are easy to understand. The quality of the Instructor consisting of the Instructor mastering the material and the Instructor providing the material clearly.

REFERENCES

- As'ad, Moh. (2005). Psikologi Industri; Edisi ke empat, Liberty, Yogyakarta
- Bernedin, H.J, dan J.E.A. Russel, 2003, Human Resources Management. McGraw Hill, Inc. Singapura
- Dessler, Garry. (2004). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Edisi Kesembilan. PT. Indeks Gramedia. Jakarta
- Fathurrochman, I. (2017). Pengembangan Kompetensi Pegawai Aparatur Sipil Negara (ASN) Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri (STAIN) Curup Melalui Metode Pendidikan Dan Pelatihan, *Manajer Pendidikan*, 11(21), 120-129.
- Faustini, C.G (2000). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Edisi I. Yogyakarta, Andi Offset.
- Fransiska, X., Achmad, D dan Bambang, I. (2016), Pelaksanaan Pendidikan Dan Pelatihan Aparatur Dalam Meningkatkan Kinerja Pegawai Di Kantor Dinas Pertambangan Dan Energi Kabupaten Kutai Barat Tahun 2015, *Jurnal Administrative Reform*, 4(3),182-193 <https://doi.org/10.52239/jar.v4i3.602>
- Handoko, Hani, T. (2006). Manajemen Personalia dan Sumber Daya Manusia. BPFE. Yogyakarta
- Hasibuan, Malayu. SP. (2002). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. PT. Remaja Rosdakarya. Bandung
- Kusnadi. (2002). Masalah, Kerja Sama, Konflik, dan Kinerja. Edisi kedua. Malang: Taroda
- Mangkunegara, A.P. 2005. Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Perusahaan. Bandung: Remaja Rosda Karya
- Martoyo, S. (2000). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia. Edisi Kelima. Yogyakarta: BPFE
- Miles, M.B, Huberman, A.M, & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourcebook*, Edition 3. USA: Sage Publications
- Moekijat. (2003). Latihan dan Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia. Mandar Maju. Bandung

- Nawawi. Hadari, (2000). Manajemen Sumberdaya Manusia Untuk Bisnis Yang Kompetitif, Cetakan I. Yogyakarta, UGM Press
- Nazir, M. (2011). Metode penelitian. Bogor : Ghalia Indonesia
- Nitisemito, Alex S. (2000). Manajemen Personalialia: Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Ed. 3, Ghalia Indonesia, Jakarta
- Notoatmojo Soekinjo. (2002). Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia. Jakarta: PT Rineka Cipta
- Rivai, V.dan Sagala (2004). Kepemimpinan dan Perilaku Kerja. Bandung. Mandar Maju
- Simamora, Henry. (2002). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Edisi kedua, Cetakan kedua, Penerbit STIE YKPN, Yogyakarta
- Siswanto (2003) Manajemen Tenaga Kerja di Indonesia. Jakarta, Bumi Aksara
- Sofyandi, H. (2008). Manajemen sumber daya manusia. Yogyakarta: Graha. Ilmu
- Sumarsono, Sonny. (2009). Ekonomi Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia dan Ketenagakerjaan. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.
- Tjandra, W. R. (2013). Hukum Administrasi Negara. Jakarta; Sinar Grafika